South Asia Consultations: Media, Information, and Participation in Displacement and Migration Settings

How free is the media?
A report on findings and recommendations
Introduction

Migrants, refugees and internally displaced people constitute a large part of the world’s population today. In absence of accurate data, rough estimates suggest the number of people affected by displacement and migration in South Asia vary from 2.5 million\textsuperscript{1} to 50 million.\textsuperscript{2} The partition of British India in 1947 led to arbitrarily drawn boundaries of the nation states and triggered the large-scale displacement of the population within the region. Today’s mixed and massive migration flows in South Asia emerge to a large extent from this violent and complex history of nation-making.

Political and military conflicts, growing majoritarianism and ethnicization of the states, conflicts between neighboring countries and geopolitical issues – all these factors contribute to displacement and mass migration. The region has witnessed some of the largest internal displacement and refugee-producing events in history, including the displacement of Sri Lankan Tamils following the protracted civil war in the country or the Rohingya fleeing from ethnic and racial violence in Myanmar. The recent Taliban takeover of the Afghan state has added to the already existing 2.2 million Afghan refugees in its neighboring countries Iran and Pakistan alone and 3.5 million internally displaced people (IDPs)\textsuperscript{3}. Additionally, rising economic inequalities, frequent climate disasters, and ecological changes cause people to move en masse to escape the cycles of precarities.

A paradox marks the lives of migrants and refugees in South Asian countries. While the neoliberal economies of the host countries largely accommodate them as informal or semi-bonded labor, growing polarization, ethno-nationalist aggressions, and xenophobia in South Asian nation-states mean that refugees and migrants are regarded as outsiders and denied important political and social rights. In a situation like this, refugees, migrants, and internally displaced people are either invisible or depicted negatively in the public discourse of host countries. Public debates on migration and refugees are rarely informed by the voices of the people affected by displacement or migration.

Regional Consultations

Over the past several years, DW Akademie and CIMA, alongside many other partners in the field, have been organizing regional consultations that bring together a wide range of stakeholders to identify key challenges facing independent media in each region and devise regional approaches to address them.

Consultations have been held in Latin America, Southeast Asia, Sub-Saharan Africa, the Middle East-Northern Africa and the Balkans. In recognition of the complex and cross-cutting nature of media systems, these consultations typically include representatives of a wide range of actors, including journalist associations, regulators, legal groups, human rights organizations, policy makers and media experts.

The consultations are intended to help our partners in each region in their efforts to strengthen political will for independent media, improve methodologies for media work, and define clearer, better articulated ideas for policy reform, with stronger ownership by beneficiaries.

\textsuperscript{2} Partha S. Ghosh, Migrants, Refugees and the Stateless in South Asia (New Delhi: Sage, 2016), 1-2.
\textsuperscript{3} UNHCR https://www.unhcr.org/afghanistan.html.
As a public good relied upon by many, the media holds a critical role in shaping public discourse around migrants and refugees by reporting responsibly on the issues affecting their everyday lives. However, as a 2017 report notes in relation to European media, the representation of refugees in the media is by and large ‘dominated by speculations and sensationalism’.4 Such narratives circulate stereotypes and further alienate refugees and migrants from the host society, leaving them unable to exercise their right to information and freedom of expression, which are fundamental human rights enshrined in Article 19 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the humanitarian attention they deserve.

Regional media in South Asia is no different. Dignified and informative coverage of refugees and migrants is abysmally rare. Humanitarian stories narrating tales of their struggles, issues plaguing their lives, and their rights and necessities are largely overlooked in media which often reproduces stereotypes like ‘outsider’, ‘intruder’, ‘criminal’, ‘immoral’, ‘economic burden’, and even ‘terrorist’. There is very little participation of the refugees and migrants themselves in their media representation. This is both a result of and a contributing factor to the increasingly shrinking space for civil society and human rights in the region. Reporting on migration and displacement, either arising out of or leading to conflicts and hostilities in various South Asian countries, poses a serious challenge in this context.

---

4 Changing the Narrative: Media Representation of Refugees and Migrants in Europe, WACC & CCME, 2017

5 Freedom of expression: A fundamental human right underpinning all civil liberties, UNESCO
https://en.unesco.org/70years/freedom_of_expression

Independent and responsible media are crucial to increase the visibility of refugees and migrants in the public discourse. With this belief, Calcutta Research Group (CRG) collaborated with DW Akademie and the Center for International Media Assistance (CIMA) to organize multi-stakeholder consultations themed ‘Media, Information, and Participation in Displacement and Migration Settings – How Free is the Media?’ These consultations, held in February and March 2022, involved journalists (including journalists in exile), documentary-makers, media experts, academics, rights activists, and representatives of civil society organizations from all eight South Asian countries – Afghanistan, Bangladesh, Bhutan, India, Maldives, Nepal, Pakistan, and Sri Lanka.

The consultations aimed to

- find out how media coverage and participation of refugees and migrants in public discourse can be improved, and
- indicate ways to strengthen regional cooperation and cross-border approaches to address the common challenges faced by the media while reporting on migration and displacement in South Asian countries.

This report was authored by Utsa Sarmin, Priyankar Dey (Calcutta Research Group) and Miriam Kueller (DW Akademie). It aims to sum up the discussions and provide avenues for further collaboration and development among key stakeholders.

The organizing team for the consultations consisted of Nasreen Chowdhory, Associate Professor, University of Delhi; Vice-President, Calcutta Research Group, India; Priyankar Dey, Researcher, Calcutta Research Group, India; Samata Biswas, Assistant Professor, The Sanskrit College and University; Treasurer, Calcutta Research Group, India; Utsa Sarmin, Researcher & Journalist, India; Andrea Marshall, Program Director, Displacement and Dialogue South Asia project, DW Akademie, Germany; Lina Elter, Deputy Program Director, Displacement and Dialogue South Asia project, DW Akademie, Germany; Miriam Kueller, Advocacy Officer, DW Akademie, Germany; Rune Meissel, Project Manager, DW Akademie, Germany; Andrea Vega Yudico, Assistant Program Officer, Center for International Media Assistance, United States.

The consultations were supported by the Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development.
Pre-consultation interviews:
Locating the challenges to a dignified and informative media portrayal of refugees and migrants

The first phase of the program included eight country-specific pre-consultation interviews and a number of one-on-one sessions with around 60 media practitioners, rights activists, lawyers, researchers, analysts, representatives of different civil society and NGO groups in January and February. Additionally, a special meeting was organized with a number of Afghan journalists and scholars who fled from the Taliban and took refuge in various European countries. The aim of these interviews was to identify the primary challenges and obstacles to dignified and informative reporting on migration and displacement. A short survey was also circulated among the participants to the same end after the pre-consultation interviews.

A recurring theme was that refugees and migrants are predominantly stereotyped and othered in the media. Fueled by growing polarization tendencies in South Asian politics and society, they are often marked as unwelcome outsiders who are a burden to the national economy or a threat to national security. The dominant narrative blames them for disrupting the fabric of the host society by indulging in crimes, drug smuggling, prostitution, and other illegal or “immoral” acts. The absence of the voices of the affected people in the media leaves the dominant narrative unchallenged. There is a general deficit of sympathetic stories about their lack of rights/statelessness, their everyday struggles, their hopes and aspirations as well as their contribution to the economy of the host country.

Why does the media fall short in this critical and urgent task? Below are the most common challenges identified by various stakeholders in the region.

- Many interviewees noted that the geopolitical stance of a host country often shapes the media narrative on refugees and migrants. Often, the host country’s attitude towards the refugees’ and migrants’ country of origin determines how the media discourse is likely to be shaped—which frequently changes as the cross-border relations between the countries change. A country’s domestic politics also play an active role in shaping the dominant media narrative. Increasing majoritarianism and ethnicization of states, leading to xenophobia, result in negative stereotyping of refugees in the media in multiple South Asian countries.

- In many countries, the media is forced to toe the narrative propagated by the government against threats of violence or other types of repercussions. In some countries, the media landscape is dominated by political elites, forcing media houses/organizations to choose sides, further limiting the possibilities of independent and unbiased reporting. In Afghanistan, the most important national media channels are now under complete control of the Taliban administration, while in other countries, media organizations are dependent on the revenue generated from government advertisements. These factors have severely restricted press freedom in multiple South Asian countries. Self-censorship, as it was repeatedly stressed by many interviewees, is a common trend in this situation.

- Financial constraints, another point emphasized during the pre-consultative interviews, constitute a major challenge to media freedom and informative reporting on
migrants and refugees. Recent economic downturns, especially after the Covid pandemic, have led to the closure of media houses and the loss of jobs resulting in understaffed newsrooms across the region. Lack of funding means that the media houses prioritize some stories over others and restrict the scope of research and in-depth field reporting. Commercial compulsions also shape the editorial policy in favor of sensationalizing the narrative and clickbait journalism at the expense of research-intensive, informative stories. All these factors contribute to the reproduction of dominant stereotypes or rendering refugees and migrants invisible in the media.

- **Lack of sensitization** of both the editorial desk as well as the journalists is also a factor to be reckoned with. Often, reporters lack proper interview techniques and other necessary training to cover sensitive stories like migration and displacement. Linguistic and cultural differences between journalists and refugees or migrants further complicate the situation. In times of shrinking revenues, media houses often lack the resources to send their staff to specialized training and sensitization workshops.

Even when there is will and a sensitized approach, well-researched and informative reporting on migrants and displaced people suffers from a paucity of data or a lack of access to it. In many countries, access to camps or refugee settlements is restricted by the government. It was also reported that local offices of international rights organizations like UNHCR are often difficult to approach, and the procedures involved in obtaining information from them are lengthy which obstructs time-bound reporting. Poor coordination between civil society organizations, research organizations and media practitioners is a major challenge to information sharing between different stakeholders.

There is also a trust deficit among refugees and migrants who are often unwilling to share their stories with the media for fear of repercussions from government agencies or local people. Information and communication challenges faced by refugees and migrants in different host countries affect their participation in the public discourse, leading to their invisibility. The language barrier plays an important role in this context. Some groups among refugees are more difficult to reach: women, for example, may be more unwilling to speak to male journalists due to the culture and traditions of the group they belong to.

- **Social media** was considered to be contributing to both information sharing and circulation of mis/disinformation. While it is a powerful tool at the hands of many refugees and migrants for accessing information and voicing their grievances and aspirations, it also supplies fodder to the hostile representation of them in the face of organized adverse propaganda.

**Consultations: In search of solutions and stronger collaboration across borders**

The four-day consultations began late February to help stakeholders address the key challenges outlined above and come up with practical and effective solutions. The online meetings held on February 28, March 2, March 9, and March 10 involved participants from earlier pre-consultation interviews as well as a number of fresh invitees and regional experts.
Special sessions

Following the welcome addresses by Nasreen Chowdhory, Vice-President, CRG, Jan Lublinski, Head of Policy and Learning Division, DW Akademie, and Andrea Vega Yudico, CIMA, the deliberations started with a keynote address by Said Nazir, Senior Journalist and Co-founder and Executive Director, Tribal News Network (TNN), Peshawar, Pakistan. Nazir stressed the common challenges like lack of research and information, biases of the news desks and the reporters, need for sensitization, political pressures, language and socio-cultural barriers etc.; while emphasizing the need for training, a regular beat on migration, and the need to train individuals as citizen journalists among refugees and displaced populations.

The first day of the consultations also featured a special session on ‘Freedom of expression: Stories of resilience from refugee camps.’ Meghna Guhathakurta, Professor and Executive Director, Research Initiatives, Bangladesh, spoke of their work on interactive theater productions in the Rohingya camps of Bangladesh. Inspired by Augusto Boal’s experiments with the ‘theatre of the oppressed,’ these theater activities in the camps constituted the organization’s action research with Rohingya refugees and provided a space for refugees, especially women, to voice their own stories. Through their active participation in the making of the theater – collecting stories through door-to-door visits and finally enacting them before their fellow camp residents – the Rohingya refugees could emerge as agents of their own stories.

In the same session, Bashana Abeywardane, a senior Sri Lankan Tamil journalist in exile and the co-ordinator of Journalists for Democracy in Sri Lanka (JDS), shared his and his fellow journalists’ struggles in bringing out the stories of the Sri Lankan Tamils who faced violent displacement during the long civil war in the country, often at the risk of their lives. JDS, Bashana urged, has to be understood as the exiled Tamil journalists’ refusal to succumb to the fate as ‘faceless’ refugees and build a collective self instead. He also mentioned that fleeing allowed journalists like him to engage with issues without repercussions unlike their colleagues back home. They can highlight problems and support others easily without constant fear of repression.
This sentiment, however, has not been shared by all. Some Afghan journalists in exile said they have been dealing with the fear of repercussions for their families back in Afghanistan.

The second day of the consultations started with a welcome lecture by Ranabir Samaddar, professor and the Distinguished Chair in Migration and Forced Migration Studies, CRG, and Head of Europe-Asia Research Platform on Forced Migration, hosted jointly by CRG and the Institute for Human Sciences, Vienna (IWM). In his address, Samaddar asked the journalists to act as critical anthropologists in posing difficult questions to unsettle the dominant narrative. Media, he argued, works by manufacturing consent in support of the political-economic elites. Hence to assume that media will now play a radical role in faithfully representing the plight and demand of refugees and migrants might be fallacious. Even when the media portrays issues related to refugees/migrants favorably, there are fault lines in such narratives, like, the racist aspects in how western media covers the Ukraine refugee situation, including the differential treatment of Ukrainian refugees as opposed to how media covered refugees from Syria in 2015. The fault lines in such dominant narratives need to be laid bare. The portrayal of refugees and migrants as agents, he urged, has the potential to break the stereotypical narrative. The ultimate goal, Samaddar asserted in conclusion, is the emancipation of people affected by migration or displacement.

Consultative meetings

With the three special sessions setting the tone of the consultations, the participants started to discuss effective solutions to the challenges. The following three general themes were identified for the final three days of the consultative meetings:

- **Day II**: How to ensure dignified and informative media coverage of migrants and refugees in South Asia?
- **Day III**: Refugees and migrants in public discourse: changing narratives, enhancing participation
- **Day IV**: Roadmap of a greater regional cooperation through the development of an action plan based on suggested solutions

The themes of the second and the third day of the consultations were further broken into six different sub-themes: *Reporting with refugees and migrants; Training in displacement and migration settings; Media viability* (Day II); and *Creative ways to include the voices of the migrants and the refugees in media; Access to Information, Data, Storytelling; Social media – challenges and benefits* (Day III). Deliberations on the fourth day focused on identifying a set of urgently required concrete actions based on the solutions discussed.

To ensure equal participation of everyone in collective brainstorming over practical and effective solutions, the participants in each session addressing separate sub-themes were divided into smaller groups and assigned to separate virtual breakout rooms. The final day of the consultations built on the solutions suggested by the participants in the previous two days and created an action plan addressing common challenges in the region and forming greater regional cooperation among the multiple stakeholders across borders.
**Recommendations**

The participants in the four days of the consultative meetings put forward the following suggestions as practical and effective solutions to change the media narrative and improve the visibility of refugees and migrants in the public discourse of the region.

**Training and sensitization**

The participants stressed the need to provide training to both young and experienced journalists in interview, research and fact-checking skills, conflict-sensitive reporting including techniques of interviewing traumatized people, as well as basic media ethics. Besides these, sensitization of both the desk and the newsroom through their orientation in issues related to refugees and migration; relevant international, regional, and national pacts and laws; is also tabled as an urgently required action. Students of journalism schools and media practitioners are not only to be trained in finding and accessing reliable data only, but also in contextualizing them. The curriculum in these training workshops or courses has to be carefully designed to address the specific challenges faced by media in every local context of a South Asian country, while not losing sight of the broad regional patterns of the problem. Most importantly, technical and sensitization training should be delivered in the vernacular languages.

**Improving information and access to information**

The consultants were of the opinion that creating an aggregated and consolidated regional database on a dedicated website is urgent. The website should also include resources other than big data, including information on training, courses, workshops, fellowships, relevant legal information, resources for journalists, examples of good stories etc. Such a database will connect relevant information available with different research organizations, media advocacy groups, civil society organizations, NGOs, international rights organizations, and other stakeholders in the region. Keeping in mind the linguistic barriers at play, translating important academic and
journalistic knowledge into the vernaculars was also emphasized as an integral part of improving the information-sharing landscape.

**Creative ways to bring out more humanitarian stories**

In today’s dynamic media scene, podcasts, talk shows, animations, comics, and documentaries offer effective ways to bring out humanitarian stories which are missed out in the mainstream media. Therefore, developing skills and capacities for all kinds of impactful media is important to break the stereotypes of refugees and migrants in the dominant public discourse.

**Amplifying the voices of refugees and migrants in media**

It was unequivocally agreed that the most effective way to change the narrative is to create adequate space in the media where the voices of the affected population can be heard. Podcasts and talk shows are excellent means to do that. Training refugees and migrants as citizen journalists or mobile journalists is another.

**Optimizing the positive effects of social media**

While combating misinformation and disinformation in social media through rigorous fact-checking is absolutely necessary, and training should be imparted on these methods, empowering refugees and migrants to bring out their own stories through social media is equally important. Developing Search Engine Optimization (SEO) and social media storytelling skills among both citizen journalists and other media practitioners can be an effective way of turning the tide of the mainstream media narrative.

**Finding alternative revenue models and resources**

Crowdfunding and subscriptions are identified as alternative revenue models for media houses to help them maintain their freedom. Similarly, fellowships can also provide sustenance to both young and experienced journalists working on migration or refugee stories.

**Building stronger cross-border networks and regional solidarity among the stakeholders**

The participants felt the need to identify the different stakeholders working in the field both within and across borders as a first step. As a next level, developing stronger ties between these different stakeholders including research organizations like CRG, media advocacy groups like Free Media Movement, Tamil Media Alliance, journalist unions like the Sri Lankan Working Journalists Association or Young Journalists Association in Sri Lanka, independent media houses like the Himal Southasian, rights organizations like Article 19, and organizations specifically working on refugee rights in all eight South Asian countries. In light of the fact that most of the refugees and migrants work as informal labor in the host countries, the need to include labor unions and labor rights organizations in this solidarity network was stressed. A common, conceptual understanding will provide the basis for interactive networking that will accommodate the views of all participating stakeholders. Collaborative training drawing on participants and resource persons from different South Asian countries was suggested as a constructive way of building regional cooperation.
Action Plan

On the last day of the consultations, the participants revisited the solutions suggested in previous meetings and developed the following action plan. It is expected that the following fourteen points will serve as a roadmap for providing effective support to regional actors in improving media coverage, information, and participation in displacement and migration settings in the days ahead.

1. Sensitization and training of the journalists and editors, as well as students of journalism schools, on
   - media ethics
   - refugee issues, relevant pacts and laws
   - research, interviewing and fact-checking skills
   - accessing data/information and contextualizing them
   - specialized subjects like covering trauma, conflict sensitive journalism or narrative journalism

2. Training should be take place in local languages and dialects.

3. Courses should be designed to address both the commonalities as well as the specificities of displacement and migration settings in different South Asian countries.

4. A network of regional actors comprising journalists, media houses, media schools, advocacy groups, rights activists, research organizations, labor unions, civil society groups etc. The network may think of bringing out digital newsletters and should try to reach out to policy-makers.

5. A dedicated website to host an aggregated and consolidated database, information on regional stakeholders, legal aid, courses, workshops, fellowships etc., and other resources including examples of good reportage.

6. Translation of important academic and journalistic knowledge resources into the vernaculars.

7. Fellowships and awards for early-career or experienced journalists to cover migration and refugee issues.

8. Developing a special beat on migration and refugees.

9. Empowering refugees and migrants to bring out their own stories through active promotion of citizen journalism, mobile journalism, digital journalism, social media storytelling and SEO skills etc.

10. Focusing on human interest stories to challenge the stereotypes by highlighting the needs and aspirations of displaced people and migrants as well as their contributions to the host society.

11. Engaging with all forms of impactful media formats including podcasts, animation, talk shows, documentaries to bring out stories in more creative ways.


13. Ensuring access to legal information and support for the journalists.

14. Organizing (digital) cross-border programs where refugees and migrants can share information or their own experiences.
Conclusion

Media, information sharing, and participation of people affected by displacement and migration in public discourses face severe challenges in South Asia. The multi-stakeholder consultations organized by CRG, DW Akademie, and CIMA acknowledge the urgent need for effective and practical collaborative, cross-border approaches to address the issues plaguing the media in this context. The consultations and the action plan that emerged out of it are believed to be only a first but necessary step towards changing the dominant narrative. The meetings in both the pre-consultative and the consultation phases witnessed enthusiastic participation by different and diverse stakeholders from the eight South Asian countries, and, therefore, inaugurated a process of building a strong network of regional actors, which is hoped to take a more concrete shape in the future.
Organizers

**Calcutta Research Group (CRG)** was founded in 1996 by a group of researchers, trade unionists, women’s rights activists, academics, journalists, and lawyers who came together on the occasion of the Third Joint Conference of the Pakistan-India People’s Forum for Peace and Democracy in Kolkata, India. Born as a facilitating group in support of the ongoing peace movement in West Bengal, India, CRG, from the very beginning, dedicated itself to policy discussion and analysis on issues of democracy, human rights, peace, and justice. As a forum of public activists and socially committed researchers, CRG is now well-known for its research, dialogues, and advocacy work on issues of migration, forced migration, displacement, dispossession, peace, conflict resolution, borders and border conflicts, citizenship, autonomy, labor and other themes relevant to democracy and human rights. In its research and advocacy work covering the last 25 years, CRG has always put special emphasis on South Asia and has been able to build a strong network of scholars, activists, and institutions in the region.

**DW Akademie** is Deutsche Welle’s center for international media development, journalism training and knowledge transfer. Projects strengthen the human right to freedom of expression and unhindered access to information. DW Akademie empowers people worldwide to make independent decisions based on reliable facts and constructive dialogue. DW Akademie is a strategic partner of the German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development but also receives funding from the Federal Foreign Office and the European Union. The organization is active in approximately 60 developing countries and emerging economies.

The **Center for International Media Assistance (CIMA)** is a research and knowledge platform within the National Endowment for Democracy in Washington D.C. dedicated to improving efforts to promote independent media in developing countries around the world. CIMA strives to build a foundation of knowledge for media development donors, implementers, and civil society actors on best practices and solutions for improving media systems.
Authors

Utsa Sarmin
Researcher & Journalist, India

Utsa Sarmin is an independent researcher and journalist. She holds her BA (Honours) and MA in Political Science from the University of Delhi and MPhil in Development Studies from the University of Cambridge. She worked as a journalist for Free Press Kashmir in Srinagar, Kashmir. She also worked for the Latin American news organization teleSUR English in Quito, Ecuador as a news writer and occasional on-camera political commentator. Utsa was a research fellow at the Calcutta Research Group. Her research interests include conflict, gender, violence, social movement, and activism.

Priyankar Dey
Researcher, Calcutta Research Group, India

Priyankar Dey is a researcher at Calcutta Research Group. He did his graduation and post-graduation in History from the Presidency College and the University of Calcutta respectively and completed his M.Phil in Social Sciences from the Centre for Studies in Social Sciences, Calcutta. He has taught history at Serampore College and the West Bengal State University. At CRG, his research covered migration and displacement. He is currently working as a project facilitator for CRG, DW Akademie, and CIMA’s project on “Media, Information, and Participation in Displacement and Migration Settings – How free is the media?”

Miriam Kueller
Advocacy Officer, DW Akademie, Germany

Miriam Kueller has worked as Advocacy Officer in the DW Akademie division for Policy and Learning since the summer of 2021. She brings strong experience in government relations, advocacy work and campaigning. Before joining DW Akademie, she worked in diplomacy and international affairs, most recently at the Canadian Embassy in Berlin. She holds master’s degrees in Political Science (Berlin) and International Human Rights Law (Oxford).